

FRATRICIDE PREVENTION: AIR-TO-GROUND OPERATIONS AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BALL REPORT

Report Published on 20 June 2011

PROJECT OVERVIEW

After a fratricide incident in Afghanistan in 2006, the Strategic Commands (SC) established a Bi-SC Analysis Lessons Learned (BALL) Team to conduct a study focusing on fratricide prevention. HQ SACT formed a Team the following year charged with implementing the recommendations from this report. In 2009 the SCs published a further, final report highlighting 19 issues influencing fratricide prevention; each issue addressed the implementation status of one or more associated corrective actions recommended from the initial report.

JALLC was tasked to analyze the fratricide prevention issues raised in the 2009 BALL Report in order to identify any unresolved NATO/ISAF issues.

Analysis objectives were:

- Assess the current (2010) implementation and resolution of NATO/ISAF issues from the BALL Report.
- Understand why issues identified as unresolved are still unresolved, and provide recommendations to resolve them.
- Report any additional fratricide prevention issues observed during the course of the study.



The JALLC Analysts from the Fratricide team wordsmith the draft report.

MAIN FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS



Afghan Commandos with the Afghan National Army's 3rd Commando Kandak patrol the village of Payendi during a clearing operation in Kandahar Province, Afghanistan.

The JALLC determined that all of the issues identified in earlier BALL reports are being addressed and that nearly half of the BALL Report issues have already been resolved. Significant effort and technological advances continue to improve and increasingly standardize NATO training, techniques, and equipment for air-to-ground operations, thereby reducing the likelihood of fratricide, but this work is not complete.

The BALL Report can serve as a model for the lessons learned process because: problems were identified; information concerning them was shared between nations and HQs; deliberate actions were taken by NATO and nations; deliberate follow up was conducted; and the remaining issues continue to be addressed. The report itself represented the validation step in the NATO LL Process and the first time that JALLC has been formally tasked with Validation analysis.

The JALLC analysis report recommends that additional work is needed to resolve (BALL) issues in Air Command & Control, Attack Helicopters Operations and Combat Identification domains, and Lessons Learned process improvement, especially in the area of leadership engagement with learning lessons.





NATO
OTAN



PROJECT EXECUTION

The final BALL report restricted its scope to air-to-ground fratricide avoidance issues. This JALLC analysis report retains the same scope as the source document to maintain focus on each of the BALL report issues and therefore does not examine ground-to-ground fratricide incidents or civilian casualties.

A detailed data collection plan was developed from the BALL report issues and the AOs. Locations visited to collect data included SHAPE, HQ ISAF, ISAF Joint Command, the Joint Air Power Competence Centre,

and Air Command HQ Ramstein. Data collection was primarily conducted through extensive document review and by interviewing staff at each location.

After data collection and analysis, a common position was achieved on the status of each issue between the FP-IPT and the JALLC team.

Following COMISAF tasking, JALLC is now involved on a joint study with the US Joint Staff's Joint Center for Operational Analysis looking at ways to reduce civilian casualties in Afghanistan

PROJECT TEAM

LTC CHRISTIAN PUIG, FRENCH ARMY

Lieutenant Colonel Christian Puig has served 31 years in the French army which includes more than 18 years as a HUMINT officer within the special forces. He has been deployed seven times in Former Yugoslavia, six times in Africa and twice to Afghanistan. As a JALLC analyst, he has participated in three different projects: KFOR intelligence architecture, ISAF Command and control, and Air to Ground Fratricide Prevention. He ended his tour at JALLC in August 2011 and reported to his new assignment at the Special Forces Command in Paris.

CDR MIKE KLEIBAUM, GERMAN NAVY

CDR Kleibaum's background is in Naval Aviation, where he flew the Panavia Tornado as Command Pilot in the German Naval Air Arm's strike-fighter squadrons. *Fratricide Prevention* was his first involvement in an analysis project after joining the JALLC as Military Analyst in October 2010.

MAJ JIRI TROJANEK, CZECH AIR FORCE

MAJ Jiří Trojáněk, Czech Air Force has served in the Armed Forces of the Czech Republic since 1984. After graduation from the Air Force Academy he served in a variety of flying ranks up to wing level within several Air Force Bases and at the Czech Joint Forces HQ. He has attended the NATO Staff Officers Course and the US Air Command and Staff College. In 2009, he was posted as a military analyst to JALLC and was deployed to Afghanistan as the JALLC Representative to HQ ISAF in 2010.

MR. ARTHUR SOSA, ANALYST

Mr. Sosa has served as a senior analyst at JALLC for nearly five year on projects influencing NATO operations in Kosovo and Afghanistan. He is a retired US Army officer with thirty years experience in command at all levels. He was commissioned as an artillery officer and later qualified as a master aviator in military helicopter and fixed wing aircraft. Mr. Sosa graduated from the US Army Senior Service College, Command and General Staff College, and holds a Masters Degree in Education.

NATO LLDB ITEMS

Since this project was designed as the validation step for existing lessons identified in the earlier BALL reports, no new lessons emerged. JALLC proposed the following status for existing lessons in the NATO LLDB:

Proposed for Lesson Learned Archived: 200, 598, 600, 606, 608, 609, 900

Proposed for Lesson Learned – Remedial Action Implemented: 248, 599, 601, 602, 603, 604, 605,

Proposed for LI – Action Body Assigned: 609, 899, 901,

Proposed for LI – Remedial Action Approved: 897

Proposed for LI – Remedial Action Sent for Approval: 612

No change noted: 391, 611, 897, 898, 1018, 1019, 1020, 1021



JALLC

JOINT ANALYSIS AND LESSONS LEARNED CENTRE
AVENIDA TENENTE MARTINS – MONSANTO
1500-589 LISBON
PORTUGAL

PHONE: +351 21 771 7007/8/9
FAX: +351 21 771 7098

NATO'S LEAD AGENT FOR JOINT ANALYSIS

All JALLC Reports, the LL Portal, and NATO LLDB Items may be found in their entirety under the *Products* section on the NS WAN:

<http://www.jallc.nato.int>

Non-classified reports and LLDB Items, Project Snapshots, the Joint Analysis Handbook and Lessons Learned Handbook can be found on JALLC's Internet the same [address](#).

A proud member of Allied Command Transformation

